New York State Common Core

English Language Arts
Curriculum

GRADE 5 Module 3B
Unit 3
Student Workbook
Map of Nunavut

Peter Fitzgerald, http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/deed.en
Directions for completing the Point of View chart:

1. With group members, read and view each of the packet resources: headlines and excerpts, graph, Mary River Iron Mine Map, and magazine cover.

2. As you review each item, notice and work with group members to determine the meaning of bolded words and phrases from context and other strategies (you may also use a dictionary and/or thesaurus).

3. Discuss in groups if each resource describes a benefit or a concern about mining on Inuit lands, and then sort and tape each resource onto either the “Benefits” or “Concerns” side of your chart.

4. After your group finishes sorting each resource, review and discuss the information you added to the “Benefits” side of your chart, and complete the sentence starter in the left box: “One point of view is …” to explain why some people think mining is beneficial to Inuit communities.

5. Review and discuss the information you added to the “Concerns” side of your chart and complete the sentence starter in the right box: “Another point of view is …” to explain why some people are concerned about mining on Inuit lands.

6. Talk with group members about both points of view, and the supporting information regarding benefits and concerns about mining, to collaboratively develop and record an initial opinion that answers the focus question:

   **Should Inuit communities allow mining in Nunavut?**

   *Remember to use key words from the question in your initial opinion statement (if you are not able to agree on one opinion, you may record more than one).
Expeditionary Learning is seeking permission to reproduce this material. When permission is granted, an updated version of this lesson will be posted at www.engageny.org and commoncoresuccess.elschools.org.

Source: http://www.mining.com/arctic-oil-extraction-frozen-but-mining-to-bring-a-melting-100-billion-investments-99646/;
http://theindependent.ca/2013/05/06/mining-the-land-the-resource-industry-in-nunavut/
Moving forward ... employment in ... resource extraction should pick up ... as mining projects enter development phases.
Mining holds great promise to help pave the way to Nunavut’s economic **self-reliance**.... It is estimated that several thousand jobs will emerge over the coming years, making the mining industry Nunavut’s largest ... employer.

... the minerals industry plays a substantial role in developing Nunavut’s infrastructure. With new **transportation networks** such as roads, port facilities, and airstrips, Nunavut will be able to provide easier and cheaper access to not only support expanding exploration programs and new mining development, but also lower the cost of living for communities.

Modified Map of Nunavut

Approximate Location of Baffinland Iron Mine

Peter Fitzgerald,
http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/deed.en
Expedition Learning is seeking permission to reproduce this material. When permission is granted, an updated version of this lesson will be posted at www.engageny.org and commoncoresuccess.elschools.org.

Modified Frayer Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Synonyms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antonyms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Examples</th>
<th>How does knowing this term help you understand the text better?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
1. With group members, reread both excerpts to determine and record both points of view (“Some people think ... / Other people think ...”).

2. With group members, skim the texts to locate and record at least two reasons and evidence in support of each point of view (four total) (“Reasons and evidence that support this point of view ...”). *Be sure to include at least one quote in support of each point of view (two total).

3. With group members, review the details recorded on your graphic organizer, as well as both texts, to write a 3-5 sentence summary of the articles (“Summary”).

4. With group members, review both points of view, reasons and evidence, your summary, and the article to develop a response to the focus question. Record your opinion about whether or not the Inuit community on Baffin Island should approve the Mary River mine proposal (“After reading both points of view, I think ...”). *Remember to use key words from the focus question in your opinion statement.

5. Pause after completing the first four steps for a whole group discussion about the boxes titled “My prediction” and “A call to action.”
**Focus Question:** Should the Inuit community on Baffin Island approve the Mary River mine proposal?

Summary:

Some people think:

Reasons and evidence that support this point of view:

Other people think:

Reasons and evidence that support this point of view:

After reading about both points of view, I think:

My prediction:

A call to action:

OR
Sample Opinion, Prediction, Call to Action

**OPINION:** Fossil fuels should no longer be used to meet our energy needs.

**PREDICTION:** If we continue using only nonrenewable fossil fuels to meet our energy needs, we will have no energy resources to use in the future.

**CALL TO ACTION:** Tell your state representative to stop allowing the use of fossil fuels to meet America’s energy needs!
Lesson 2 Homework: Letter to a Partner Task Card

1. Reread “Excerpts from the Qikiqtani Inuit Association Web Site.”
2. Select two highlighted terms from the text and use them to complete the modified Frayer Models below. Select terms that are different from the term you analyzed in class.
3. Write a letter to your partner that shares your response to the text.
   - As you think about your letter, consider the following questions:
     - Why is this text important?
     - What does the author want readers to understand about the issue?
     - What do you think is the most important reason to approve or not approve the mine?
   - Your letter should include:
     - The date
     - A greeting
     - At least one body paragraph
     - At least seven sentences
     - A closing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Synonyms</th>
<th>Antonyms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key Term</strong></td>
<td>Examples</td>
<td>How does knowing this term help you understand the text better?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Synonyms</th>
<th>Antonyms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key Term</strong></td>
<td>Examples</td>
<td>How does knowing this term help you understand the text better?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CBC, September 13, 2012

A massive open-pit iron mine proposed on northern Baffin Island would be the North’s largest industrial development to date, but Nunavut residents are divided over what it would mean for the territory.

Some people in Nunavut welcome the potential wealth they could gain from the mine. Others, however, are wary about its potential impacts.

Baffinland says the project, if approved by regulators, will benefit Inuit who live in the region. For one, the company will need about 3,000 people to build the mine and 950 people to run it. The mine will not only be a potential source for employment, but also a huge financial boon.

Though the Government of Nunavut supports the proposed mine, it has voiced concerns to the Nunavut Impact Review Board about environmental impacts.

Baffinland says its project will have little or no impact on wildlife.
Point of View Task Card

1. With group members, reread both excerpts to determine and record both points of view (“Some people think” and “Other people think”).

2. With group members, skim the texts to locate and record at least three reasons and evidence in support of each point of view (six total—“Reasons and evidence that support this point of view”). *Be sure to include at least one quote in support of each point of view (two total).

3. With group members, review the details recorded on your graphic organizer, as well as both texts, to write a three- to five-sentence summary of both articles (“Summary”).

4. With group members, review both points of view, reasons and evidence, your summary, and the articles to develop a response to the focus question and record your opinion about whether the Inuit community on Baffin Island should approve the Mary River mine proposal (“After reading both points of view, I think”). *Remember to use key words from the focus question in your opinion statement.

5. Think about, discuss with group members, and then record a prediction or a call to action in support of your opinion (“My prediction,” “A call to action”).
Focus question: Should the Inuit community on Baffin Island approve the Mary River mine proposal?

Summary:

Some people think:

Reasons and evidence that support this point of view:

Other people think:

Reasons and evidence that support this point of view:

After reading more about both points of view, I think:

My prediction:

A call to action:

OR
Lesson 3 Homework:
Analyzing Key Terms Task Card

Directions:
• Select one highlighted key term from each of the expert texts.
• Use the terms you selected to complete the two modified Frayer Models below.
Multibillion-dollar Iron Mine Approved for Baffin Island

CBC News Posted: Sep 15, 2012

1. The Nunavut Impact Review Board (NIRB) issued its final report Friday night allowing Baffinland's Mary River iron project to proceed, with conditions.

2. The board’s decision is the culmination of a four-year assessment of the project, in which Baffinland Iron Mines Corporation plans to build a massive open-pit mine at its Mary River site ... along with a railway and port that would allow icebreakers to ship the ore through Arctic waters year-round.

3. The 17,000-hectare mine will cost about $4 billion to build.

4. "Obviously NIRB recommended in the direction we were hoping they would," said Baffinland spokesperson Greg Missal. "Now we have to spend a number of days looking at the document and looking at the terms and conditions."

5. The decision comes with close to 200 terms and conditions, most of them focused on monitoring and minimizing some of the possible negative environmental and social effects of the development.

6. A wide range of concerns on the project were raised during the final public hearings this summer. They included:
   - the mine's potential impact on the North Baffin caribou herd and on archeological sites;
   - the possibility of oil spills in the shipping lane and disruptions to marine wildlife;
   - the availability of training and jobs for Inuit;
   - and the possible social problems that could result from an influx of money into nearby communities.

7. In Igloolik, one of the closest communities to the proposed mine site, acting mayor Peter Ivalu said the mine will mean jobs. But his community is still divided.

8. "It's about 50-50," he said. "There's still some opposition to the project going ahead."

Used with permission: Canadian Broadcasting Corporation(CBC)
Guiding questions:
- How can we develop informed opinions about an issue through research, analysis, and reflection upon different points of view?
- Why is it important for authors to use clear reasons and credible evidence to support their opinions?

*Refer to “Multibillion-dollar Iron Mine Approved for Baffin Island” and the video excerpt, “Nunavut Mega Project Approved,” to help you respond to these questions.

### Directions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the first sentence, first paragraph, what do you think the words <em>proceed</em> and <em>conditions</em> mean? Record each term on its own index card, then determine and record a <em>definition</em>, <em>synonym</em>, and <em>antonym</em> for each word.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* As time allows, sketch an image to represent the meaning of each word.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What important ideas is the author trying to immediately convey to the reader by including these two words at the beginning of the article?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What do most of the 200 terms and conditions focus on?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complete the chart to show the “negative environmental impacts” and “social effects” the review board is concerned about.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Negative Environmental Impacts</th>
<th>Social Effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With group members, read **Paragraphs 1 and 2 of the article** aloud together. Then work together to answer the questions on the right.

With group members, whisper-read **Paragraphs 5 and 6, plus the bullet points of the article**. Then work together to respond to the questions on the right.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Directions</th>
<th>Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independently, read <strong>Paragraphs 7 and 8 of the article.</strong> Then discuss the questions on the right with group members before recording your responses.</td>
<td>Based on the last two paragraphs of the article and what you have read so far, what do you think the Igloolik community is still <em>divided</em> about?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Why would some people in the Igloolik community still be <em>opposed</em> to the project?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With group members, read together and then restate the question to the right in your own words. Keep the question in mind as you view and listen to the video excerpt (1:13–1:55). You may record notes about your thinking in the margin of your note-catcher as you view and listen to the video to help you remember details from the excerpt. You will discuss your thinking in groups before recording a response.</td>
<td>According to the reporter, what is the Mary River mine expected to <em>deliver</em> in the North?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Directions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Questions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With group members, read aloud and then restate the questions to the right in your own words. Keep the questions in mind as you view and listen to the <strong>video clip (1:55–2:52)</strong>. You may record notes about your thinking in the margin of this note-catcher as you view and listen to the video, to help you remember details from the clip. You will discuss your thinking in groups before recording your responses.</td>
<td>Why was the project review “so long and involved”?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What are the concerns regarding the types of transportation that will be used to get iron ore from the mine to Europe (e.g., railway, deep-water port, icebreakers)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Directions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Questions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With group members, whisper-read and then restate the question on the right. Keep the question in mind as you view and listen to last few seconds of the <strong>video clip (2:52–3:05)</strong>. You may record notes about your thinking in the margin of this note-catcher to help you remember details from the clip that help you to answer the question. You will discuss your thinking with group members before recording a response.</td>
<td>What did the review board focus on?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Directions
Refer once again to the article and your response to each of the questions above to determine your answers to the questions on the right.

### Questions

After analyzing multiple accounts of the Mary River project, determine which of the following statements BEST explains the similarities and differences between the points of view presented in the article and video. Place a check mark next to the answer you choose. Be prepared to discuss your thinking by referring to details from the article and your responses.

- Both sides want to keep a traditional lifestyle and to protect the environment; they disagree about whether the review board should approve the project.
- Both sides want jobs, money, and infrastructure that the mine will bring; they disagree about how many jobs the mine will bring and how much the project will affect the environment.
- Both sides want the mine to be built; they disagree about whether they want the jobs, money, and infrastructure the mining company will bring to the area.

After learning more about the Mary River project, what is your opinion about whether the Inuit community of Baffin Island should allow Baffinland’s mining proposal to move forward?

Has your initial opinion changed or remained the same? Explain why, using reasons and evidence from the texts you read and viewed today.
Should We DRILL?

Weighing economic concerns against environmental ones.

Large areas of U.S. coastal waters are set to be opened to offshore drilling for oil and natural gas. President Barack Obama says it was an easy decision to allow new offshore drilling in the Atlantic Ocean south of New Jersey, the Gulf of Mexico, and part of Alaska (see map). His plan reverses a decades-long ban on drilling in areas other than the Gulf. People concerned about how much oil the U.S. buys from other countries and worried about the jobs oil and gas exploration may create say it is a step in the right direction. People concerned about the environmental damage drilling can cause are outraged. Read on to learn more. Then you decide!

YES

We’ll Energize America

Oil fuels America. The fuel for your car, your power plants, and your homes. Americans use 18.5 million barrels of oil each day. That is the most of any country in the world. The United States imports some of its own oil, but it buys most of it from nations like Canada and Saudi Arabia. Oil is big business. It’s a $1 trillion industry. Oil companies provide more than 160,000 jobs in the U.S. Geologists figure out the best places to drill for it. They control the cost of oil—whether it drops or rises. Offshore drilling is a key to keeping the cost of oil down. Hundreds of engineers, operators, and technicians are needed to work on a rig. Jobs also employ people like cooks, doctors, and cleaning staff to take care of the rig workers’ needs.

Reducing America’s need to buy oil from foreign countries and creating more U.S. jobs are major reasons that some people support President Obama’s decision to expand offshore drilling. The perceived benefits may be years more. But supporters say Obama’s move is a step in the right direction. “The President’s decision… will mean thousands of new jobs.” For Virginians, says Virginia Governor Bob McDonnell, “Virginia is one of the states affected by Obama’s decision. It will also help our nation take a further step towards energy independence,” adds McDonnell.

Leatherback turtles along the Atlantic and Gulf coasts see similar benefits.

With record gas prices straining the budgets of many Georgia families, we cannot afford to take any action against the oil.” says Georgia Governor Sonny Perdue, a longtime supporter of offshore drilling.

NO

We’ll Enter Dangerous Waters

Breaks and other waterfowl covered in suffocating oil. Beaches damaged during the construction of needed oil rigs. Air and water pollution. These are among the concerns critics have about President Obama’s plan to open more of America’s continental shelf to oil drilling.

“This is not a decision that I’ve made lightly,” Obama says. The President says he had to balance the need to protect America’s natural resources with the country’s increasing need for energy and jobs.

Offshore drilling is one part of a larger energy plan, according to Obama. Ultimately, the President says, he wants to end the country’s dependence on foreign fuels—and on foreign sources of those fuels. His aim is cleaner energy—like wind power—and greater use of oil and gas found in U.S. waters.

Many environmental groups and lawmakers are not happy about the drilling. They say the risks to the environment are too great. They believe the President should focus on pushing Americans toward cleaner, renewable energy, instead of continuing to support the use of oil and other fossil fuels. Even in states like New Jersey, whose offshore drilling will not take place, there is concern about routes brought there by wind and waves.

“It makes no sense to threaten the East Coast of America… with spills and other drilling disasters, when we have so much oil and gas under the ocean,” he said. “Those are the real solutions to energy dependence—cheaper, cleaner, renewable energy,” says Doug O’Malley of Environmental New Jersey.

Words to Know

perceived: expected, believed, imagined.
renewable: energy replenished naturally.
nonrenewable: energy used up.
ecosystem: a self-sustaining group of living organisms and their environment.

Offshore Oil Drilling in the U.S.

From Scholastic News, April 26, 2010. Copyright © 2010 by Scholastic Inc. Reprinted by permission of Scholastic Inc.
Long-Term Learning Targets Assessed:
I can quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text. (RI.5.1)
I can analyze multiple accounts of the same topic, noting important similarities and differences in the point of view they represent. (RI.5.6)
I can explain how the author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text. (RI.5.8)
I can paraphrase information in notes. (W.5.8)
I can draw evidence from informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. (W.5.9b)
I can determine the meaning of unknown words and phrases, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies. (L.5.4)
  a. I can use context as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase.
  b. I can use common, grade-appropriate Greek and Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word.

Directions:
1. Reread the article “Should We Drill?”
2. Refer to the article to help you fill in the Point of View graphic organizer:
   – Determine and record both points of view (“Some people think” and “Other people think”).
   – Record at least three reasons and evidence in support of each point of view (six total—“Reasons and evidence that support this point of view”). *Be sure to include at least one quote in support of each point of view (two total).
   – Summarize the article in three to five sentences (“Summary”).
   – Review both points of view, reasons and evidence, your summary, and the article to develop a response to the focus question and record your opinion about offshore oil drilling in the United States (“After reading both points of view, I think”). *Remember to use key words from the focus question in your opinion statement.
   – Record a prediction or a call to action in support of your opinion (“My prediction,” “A call to action”).
3. Refer to your notes and the article to respond to the text-dependent questions.
Focus question: Should offshore oil drilling be allowed along the Atlantic Coast of the United States?

Summary:

Some people think:

Reasons and evidence that support this point of view:

Other people think:

Reasons and evidence that support this point of view:

After reading about both points of view, I think:

My prediction:

A call to action:

OR
1. Determine the meaning of the term in bold, using context clues.
   a. In the sentence “His plan reverses a decades-long **ban** on drilling in areas other than the Gulf,” what does the word **ban** mean?
      - [ ] order
      - [ ] allow
      - [ ] stop

   b. How did you use context clues to determine the meaning of the word **ban**?

2. Determine the meaning of the term in bold, using context clues as well as your knowledge about common prefixes and root words.
   a. In the sentence “It makes no sense to threaten the East Coast of America ... with spills and other drilling disasters when we’re about to **unleash** the real solutions to energy dependence,” what does the word **unleash** mean?
      - [ ] let loose
      - [ ] keep under control
      - [ ] begin to develop

   b. How did you use context clues or the prefix and root word in **unleash** to determine the meaning of this word?
3. Which of the following reasons and evidence does the author use to explain why offshore oil drilling should be allowed in the United States?

☐ Offshore oil drilling won’t really harm the environment; beaches and marine life are not affected.

☐ Americans will benefit right away from offshore oil drilling; gas prices will drop almost immediately.

☐ It will create more American jobs; oil companies provide more than 100,000 jobs in the United States.

4. Which of the following reasons and evidence does the author use to explain why offshore oil drilling should not be allowed in the United States?

☐ There are no benefits to offshore oil drilling; it will not create jobs or meet America’s energy needs.

☐ Offshore oil drilling will cause damage to beaches; there will be air and water pollution from toxins and oil spills.

☐ Offshore oil drilling will not provide very much energy; the oil available along the Atlantic Coast is not enough to meet America’s energy needs.

5. Based on information from the article, which of the following statements BEST describes important similarities and differences between both points of view regarding offshore oil drilling in the United States?

☐ Both sides agree that America needs to find additional energy sources; they disagree about the type of energy sources America should be developing.

☐ Both sides agree offshore oil drilling will cause environmental damage; they disagree about how much environmental damage will be caused.

☐ Both sides agree offshore oil drilling will create jobs; they disagree about how many jobs will be created.
Learning Target: I can paraphrase to explain the reasons and evidence given to support two different points of view about offshore oil drilling in the United States.

1. The target in my own words is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

I need more help to learn this    I understand some of this    I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Tracking My Progress, Mid-Unit 3

Name: 

Date: 

**Learning Target:** I can support my research, analysis, and reflection on the issue of offshore oil drilling by drawing upon evidence from the text.

1. The target in my own words is:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

I need more help to learn this   I understand some of this   I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
Learning Target: I can support my research, analysis, and reflection on the issue of offshore oil drilling by drawing upon evidence from the text.

1. The target in my own words is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

[ ] I need more help to learn this

[ ] I understand some of this

[ ] I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Learning Target: I can determine the meaning of unknown words, using a variety of strategies.

1. The target in my own words is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

I need more help to learn this  I understand some of this  I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Imagine yourself driving along a deserted stretch of wind-blown land. You come over a little rise and see a field of giant pinwheels—white steel towers topped with blades spinning madly in the wind. What you are seeing is a wind farm, a new and growing source of electrical energy. Some people think wind power is part of the solution to our need for new energy resources, but others worry that wind turbines, the towers that turn wind into energy, are ugly, noisy, and harmful to migrating birds. I think that the wind is a valuable source of energy. Wind will never run out, and it doesn’t contaminate the environment.

Wind power is a renewable source of energy. The wind is present everywhere on the planet, and it is never going to stop blowing. Other energy sources, like coal and oil, will run out someday. This is one reason why the cost of coal is rising while the cost of wind power is dropping steadily. The winds that blow offshore are especially strong and reliable, which makes offshore wind farms a very promising source of energy to power our coastal cities.

Wind is also a great energy source because it produces no pollution. When coal and other fossil fuels are burned to generate electricity, they fill the air with dangerous pollutants that can make it hard to breathe. Oil spills and coal mining also cause water pollution. Mining for fossil fuels can leave the land barren, but farms can still grow crops right next to where wind turbines are built.

The wind is one source of energy we will be able to count on for an unlimited amount of time. Wind can also provide electricity without causing extensive damage to the environment. Therefore, I believe people should begin to recognize the value of this incredible resource. If we act now to harness this renewable and clean form of energy, then we can save our earth from further harm.
The Painted Essay®
A tool for teaching basic essay form

Introduction
*Catches the readers’ attention*
*Gives some background information*

THESIS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Point 1</th>
<th>Point 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Proof Paragraph 1
*Gives evidence and reasons to support point 1*

Transition

Proof Paragraph 2
*Gives evidence and reasons to support point 2*

Conclusion
*What?*
*So What?*

© Diana Leddy and The Vermont Writing Collaborative
Narrative Lead:

Imagine yourself driving along a deserted stretch of wind-blown land. You come over a little rise and see a field of giant pinwheels—white steel towers topped with blades spinning madly in the wind. What you are seeing is a wind farm, a new and growing source of electrical energy. Some people think that wind power is part of the solution to our need for new energy resources. Others worry that wind turbines, the towers that turn wind into energy, are ugly, noisy, and harmful to migrating birds. I think that the wind is a valuable source of energy. Wind will never run out, and it doesn’t contaminate the environment.

Quote:

According to Cindy Bothwell, manager of Integrated Resource Planning for PNM, a company that buys wind power to sell as electricity to its customers, "Wind farms help our nation's energy supply without creating greenhouse gases or other pollutants.” This quote illustrates that some people think wind power is part of the solution to our need for new energy resources. However, other people worry that wind turbines, the towers that turn wind into energy, are ugly, noisy, and harmful to migrating birds. I think that the wind is a valuable source of energy. Wind will never run out, and it doesn’t contaminate the environment.

Quote/Statistic:

Some people think that wind power is part of the solution to our need for new energy resources. Others worry that wind turbines, the towers that turn wind into energy, are ugly, noisy, and harmful to migrating birds. I think that the wind is a valuable source of energy. Wind will never run out, and it doesn’t contaminate the environment. In fact, "wind energy could provide as much as 25 percent of our electricity [in the future],” according to U.S. Secretary of Energy Steven Chu.
**Focus question:** Should offshore oil drilling be allowed along the Atlantic Coast of the United States?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Point 1 (Reason 1):</th>
<th>Proof Paragraph 1: Evidence related to Point 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Point 2 (Reason 2)</th>
<th>Proof Paragraph 2: Evidence related to Point 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. With group members, review and discuss details from the article “Should We Drill?” and your Point of View graphic organizers. Locate and highlight evidence that supports Point 1 (Reason 1) and the thesis (opinion) in yellow.

2. With group members, review and discuss details from the article “Should We Drill?” and your Point of View graphic organizers. Locate and highlight evidence that supports Point 2 (Reason 2) and the thesis (opinion) in blue.

3. With group members, review all the evidence you highlighted to choose and record three pieces of evidence that support Point 1 (Reason 1) in the yellow box and three pieces of evidence that support Point 2 (Reason 2) in the blue box of your group’s Proof Paragraphs graphic organizer. Be sure to include both paraphrased evidence and quotes.

4. Be prepared to discuss your thinking whole class.
1. With group members, review Point 1 (Reason 1) and discuss how you could restate it to write the first sentence of Proof Paragraph 1.

2. On your Draft Editorial chart, indent and then record the first sentence of Proof Paragraph 1 just below your introductory paragraph (a restatement of Point 1).

3. Review the evidence you recorded in support of Point 1 (Reason 1), then discuss with group members:
   – In what order should we add this evidence to our first proof paragraph?
   – Which piece of evidence would make a strong connection to Point 1?
   – Which piece of evidence should come next?
   – Which piece of evidence would be best to end the first paragraph and also help transition into the next proof paragraph?

4. Add three sentences to Proof Paragraph 1 that support both Point 1 (Reason 1) and the thesis (opinion) of your editorial.

5. Repeat the above steps for Proof Paragraph 2.

6. Be prepared to share your paragraphs aloud with the class.

**NOTE:** Refer to the Model Painted Essay: Editorial about Wind Power for ideas.
Conclusion Paragraph Task Card

1. Independently reread your group’s introductory paragraph about offshore oil drilling.

2. With group members, chorally reread the thesis (opinion) of the introductory paragraph. Think about, then discuss:
   - “How can we restate the thesis (opinion) in a new and interesting way to convey the What? of our conclusion?”
   - “How can we use specific language and key terms from the thesis (opinion) in our conclusion?”

3. Come to consensus. Then work together to record a sentence that restates the thesis (opinion) on one of your idea strips.

4. Independently, reread the points of your group’s introductory paragraph, as well as both proof paragraphs. Think about and discuss:
   - “How can we express our own thinking about why offshore oil drilling should or should not be allowed along the Atlantic Coast of the United States?”
   - “How can we explain the So What? of our editorial focus by adding a prediction or call to action to the conclusion?” (Hint: See the lower boxes of your Mid-Unit 3 Assessment: Point of View graphic organizer for ideas.)
   - “How can we use specific language and key terms to emphasize important details about offshore oil drilling along the Atlantic Coast of the United States?”

5. Come to consensus. Then work together to record two or three additional sentences for your group’s conclusion paragraph on your remaining idea strips.

6. Once your group has recorded the What? and So What? of your conclusion onto idea strips, move the strips around to place sentences in the order you collectively think makes the most sense.

7. With group members, read aloud through the sentences in the order you placed them, as if you are reading the complete conclusion paragraph. Then discuss:
   - “Does this make sense?”
   - “Does it sound right?”
   - “Do these sentences clearly connect back to our thesis (opinion), points (reasons), and proof paragraphs in a sequence that makes sense?”

8. Continue to move the idea strips around until all group members feel they can answer yes to each of the questions from Step 7.

9. Once your group has the idea strips in the proper order, paste them onto the group Draft Editorial chart, below the second proof paragraph, and prepare to share out with the class.
Sample opinion linked to reasons:

Summer is the best time of year *because* there is so much to do outside!

Sample reason linked to evidence:

There is so much to do outdoors during the summer. *One example* of a fun summer activity is swimming at the pool. *Something else* to do outside in the summer is play baseball with friends. *As a matter of fact*, there are so many things to do outside when the weather is warm that it’s almost impossible to choose what to do next!

Practice

With group members, read each sentence below, then identify and underline the linking word or phrase in each one. Be prepared to explain how each linking word or phrase connects the opinion to the reason and reasons to evidence.

1. The best pet to have is a turtle, since a turtle can live for a really long time.
2. Turtles can live for decades. In fact, one turtle born in the late 1700s lived to be 188 years old.
3. I don’t think people should be allowed to talk on their cell phones during a movie because it interferes with other people’s enjoyment of the movie.
4. It’s hard to enjoy a movie when someone is talking on a cell phone. For one, it’s hard to hear the movie. Moreover, it can be distracting when someone is talking loudly.
The People and Their Work

Nunavut is the native homeland of the Inuit, who make up nearly 85 percent of the total population. In 2001, its population was almost 27,000, making Nunavut the least populated territory in Canada.

Although about 85 percent of the people are employed by the federal, territorial, and local governments, unemployment is a serious problem. Nunavut has few resources. Without fertile land and forests, the territory’s natural wealth lies in its minerals, petroleum deposits, and wildlife. Minerals are found in the Canadian Shield, and oil and gas deposits exist in the Arctic Islands.

Hunting for caribou and seal is a traditional aspect of the Inuit culture that provides fresh meat for Inuit families and a modest income from seal pelts. The fur industry is based on seal, white fox, and polar bears. Fishing is also important to Nunavut’s economy. Most commercial fishing takes place at the mouths of the main rivers flowing into the Arctic Ocean and Hudson Bay. Arctic char is the most important commercial fish.

Nunavut abounds in natural beauty, and the tourist industry, while still small, is growing.

Cities

Most of Nunavut’s inhabitants live in settlements (very small villages). Iqaluit, the capital, is the largest city, with a population of about 5,300. Iqaluit is located on the southern part of Baffin Island. Rankin Inlet, the second largest settlement, has a population of about 2,200.

R.M. Bone
Department of Geography
University of Saskatchewan

Lexile: 970

Part 1: Text-Dependent Questions

Directions:
• Read the article “Nunavut.”
• Consider the gist of the article—what it is mostly about.
• Skim the assessment questions below.
• Reread the text in chunks to help you think about the answers to the assessment questions.
• Answer short response questions in complete sentences.
• Be sure to cite evidence from the text to support your thinking.
• After you complete Part 1 of the assessment, complete Part 2: Editorial Draft.

1. Part A: According to the article, what is a problem for the people of Nunavut?
   a. They live in the least populated area of Canada.
   b. Most of the people in Nunavut work for the government.
   c. Unemployment is an ongoing problem.
   d. There are not enough seals or caribou to hunt.

   Part B: Support your response to Part A with a quote from the text.

   ________________________________________________________________
   ________________________________________________________________
   ________________________________________________________________
2. Name three sources of “natural wealth” in the Nunavut territory.

________________________________________
________________________________________
________________________________________

On the lines below, record a quote from the text to support your response.

________________________________________
________________________________________
________________________________________

3. In the sentence “Hunting for caribou and seal is a traditional aspect of the Inuit culture that provides fresh meat for Inuit families and a modest income from seal pelts,” what does the word aspect mean? Use context clues to help you.

   a. expression
   b. part
   c. viewpoint

   How did you use context clues to determine the meaning of aspect?
4. In the sentence “Most of Nunavut’s *inhabitants* live in settlements (very small villages),” what does the word *inhabitants* mean? Use context clues and your knowledge of common prefixes, roots, and suffixes to record a short definition or synonym for *inhabitants*, on the line below.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

Explain how you used context clues, prefixes, roots, and/or suffixes to determine the meaning of *inhabitants*.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
Part 2: Draft Editorial

Directions:

1. Think about the focus question: Should the Inuit community approve the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island?

2. Review the assessment text “Nunavut,” your Point of View graphic organizers, Nunavut Mine note-catcher, and the informational texts you read during the first part of the unit about the Mary River Project to help you develop each part of your editorial draft.

3. On your lined paper, develop an introductory paragraph that includes:
   - An introduction that grabs the reader’s attention and provides background knowledge about the topic of your essay
   - A thesis (opinion)
   - Two points (reasons)

4. Review your graphic organizers, note-catcher, and texts to identify and record three pieces of evidence to support each point (reason) from your introductory paragraph (six pieces of evidence total), on the chart provided.

5. Below your introductory paragraph, write “Proof Paragraph 1” to support “Point 1.” Make sure to include the following:
   - A restatement of Point 1 (Reason 1)
   - Three pieces of evidence in support of Point 1 and the thesis
   - At least one piece of evidence in the form of a quote

6. Below “Proof Paragraph 1,” write “Proof Paragraph 2” to support “Point 2.” Make sure to include the following:
   - A restatement of Point 2 (Reason 2)
   - Three pieces of evidence in support of Point 2 and the thesis
   - At least one piece of evidence in the form of a quote

7. Write a conclusion paragraph for your essay that explains the “what?” and “so what?” of your editorial.

8. Check your work against the Criteria for an Editorial Essay and make revisions as needed.
**Focus Question:** Should the Inuit community approve the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Point 1 (Reason 1):</th>
<th>Proof Paragraph 1: Evidence related to Point 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Point 2 (Reason 2)</td>
<td>Proof Paragraph 2: Evidence related to Point 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tracking My Progress End of Unit 3 Form

Name: 
Date: 

**Learning Target:** I can explain information about the Inuit territory of Nunavut by quoting accurately from the text.

1. The target in my own words is:

   ___________________________________________________________
   ___________________________________________________________
   ___________________________________________________________
   ___________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

   I need more help to learn this
   
   I understand some of this
   
   I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

   ___________________________________________________________
   ___________________________________________________________
   ___________________________________________________________
   ___________________________________________________________
Learning Target: I can draw upon evidence from the informational texts I’ve read and viewed about the Mary River mine proposal to support the thesis and points of my editorial.

1. The target in my own words is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

I need more help to learn this

I understand some of this

I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
**Learning Target:** I can write a four-paragraph editorial essay that supports my point of view about the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island.

1. The target in my own words is:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

2. How am I doing? Circle one.

I need more help to learn this  I understand some of this  I am on my way!

3. The evidence to support my self-assessment is:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONTENT AND ANALYSIS: the extent to which the essay conveys ideas and information clearly and accurately in order to support an analysis of topics or texts</td>
<td>__clearly introduce a topic in a manner that follows logically from the task and purpose</td>
<td>__clearly introduce a topic in a manner that follows from the task and purpose</td>
<td>__introduce a topic in a manner that follows generally from the task and purpose</td>
<td>__Introduce a topic in a manner that does not logically follow from the task and purpose</td>
<td>__demonstrate a lack of comprehension of the text(s) or task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>__demonstrate insightful comprehension and analysis of the text(s)</td>
<td>__demonstrate grade-appropriate comprehension and analysis of the text(s)</td>
<td>__demonstrate a literal comprehension of the text(s)</td>
<td>__demonstrate little understanding of the text(s)</td>
<td>__demonstrate a lack of comprehension of the text(s) or task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMAND OF EVIDENCE: the extent to which the essay presents evidence from the provided texts to support analysis and reflection</td>
<td>__develop the focus with relevant, well-chosen facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s)</td>
<td>__develop the focus with relevant facts, definitions, details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s)</td>
<td>__partially develop the focus of the essay with the use of some textual evidence, some of which may be irrelevant</td>
<td>__demonstrate an attempt to use evidence, but only develop ideas with minimal, occasional evidence which is generally invalid or irrelevant</td>
<td>__provide no evidence or provide evidence that is completely irrelevant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>__sustain the use of varied, relevant evidence</td>
<td>__sustain the use of relevant evidence, with some lack of variety</td>
<td>__use relevant evidence inconsistently</td>
<td>__use relevant evidence inconsistently</td>
<td>__use relevant evidence inconsistently</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Criteria for an Editorial Essay

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>COHERENCE, ORGANIZATION, AND STYLE:</strong> the extent to which the essay logically organizes complex ideas, concepts, and information using formal style and precise language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> exhibit clear, purposeful organization/exhibit use of all parts of the Painted Essay structure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> skillfully link ideas using grade-appropriate words and phrases</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong> use grade-appropriate, stylistically sophisticated language and domain-specific vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong> provide a concluding statement that follows clearly from the focus and points presented</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0</strong> exhibit no evidence of organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> exhibit some attempt at organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> inconsistently link ideas using words and phrases</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong> use grade-appropriate precise language and domain-specific vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong> provide a concluding statement that follows from the focus and points presented</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0</strong> exhibit no use of linking words and phrases</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> exhibit little attempt at organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> inconsistently use appropriate language and domain-specific vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong> provide a concluding statement that follows generally from the focus and points presented</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong> lack the use of linking words and phrases</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0</strong> use language that is predominantly incoherent or copied directly from the text(s)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> provide a concluding statement that is illogical or unrelated to the topic and information presented</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> do not provide a concluding statement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>0</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Directions:
Read your partner’s draft editorial about whether or not the Inuit community should approve the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island.

1. Review the criteria for each part of an editorial essay.

2. Reread your partner’s editorial and provide kind and specific feedback about each part of the editorial (introduction, two proof paragraphs, and conclusion paragraphs), based on the criteria:
   a. At least one to two *Stars*—what your partner did well to meet the criteria.
   b. One to two *Steps*—helpful and kind suggestions about how your partner could revise his or her editorial to better meet the criteria.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parts of the Painted Essay</th>
<th>Criteria for an Editorial Essay</th>
<th>Written feedback: Stars and Steps</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introductory Paragraph</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION:</td>
<td>Star(s):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Includes an “attention-getter”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Provides background information (“Some people think ... / Other people think ...”)</td>
<td>Step(s):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>THESIS:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clearly states the author’s thesis (opinion) and uses key words from the focus question: “Should the Inuit community approve the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island?”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>POINTS:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Provides two points (reasons) in support of the thesis (opinion)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parts of the Painted Essay</td>
<td>Criteria for an Editorial Essay</td>
<td>Written feedback: Stars and Steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Proof Paragraph 1**    | - Clearly restates Point 1 (Reason 1, from the introductory paragraph)  
                           - Provides three pieces of *credible* evidence in support of Point 1 (Reason 1) and the thesis (opinion)  
                           - Evidence includes at least one quote from texts read in class  
                           - Includes linking words and/or phrases that accurately connect ideas and improve the readability of the piece | Star(s): **★**  
Step(s): |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parts of the Painted Essay</th>
<th>Criteria for an Editorial Essay</th>
<th>Written feedback: Stars and Steps</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion Paragraph</td>
<td>WHAT? Restates the thesis (opinion) in a new and interesting way</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SO WHAT?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>− Expresses the author's own thinking about the thesis or focus of the editorial</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>− Includes a “prediction” or “call to action” in support of the author’s thesis or focus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Star(s): ★

Step(s): ⬇️
Complete the following:

1. Review the comments each of your “reviewers” made.

2. Ask your reviewers any clarifying questions about the comments.

3. Revise the introductory, proof, and/or conclusion paragraphs of your editorial based on the feedback from your reviewers.

4. Share your revisions with reviewers to see if you addressed their feedback.
Lesson 10 Discussion Questions

Review each of the questions below. Then refer to your revised editorial essay to help you determine and record a response to each question. (If you are not able to determine an answer based on information from your editorial, you may refer to your texts, graphic organizers, and note-catcher from Lessons 2–4, for help.)

1. What is the thesis of your editorial?

2. Summarize both points of view regarding the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island and explain how learning about different points of view helped you develop your thesis (opinion).

3. What do you feel is the clearest point (reason) and most credible piece of evidence in support of your thesis? Record the point and evidence below. Then briefly explain why you think they are the clearest point and most credible piece of evidence in support of your thesis.
Complete each part of the feedback form below for your speaker. Be sure to provide comments to explain your thinking and support your speaker’s ability to make revisions to his or her editorial.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collaborative Skill</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Somewhat</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Reviewer Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The speaker clearly states the thesis of her/his editorial.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The speaker clearly and accurately explains both points of view regarding the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The speaker shares at least one clear reason and one credible piece of evidence from her/his editorial, in support of her/his thesis.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The speaker respectfully asks questions to clarify understanding of other speakers’ ideas, as needed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The speaker actively listens to other speakers in the circle by making eye contact and providing others with time to speak.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fishbowl Discussion Feedback Form

In one to two sentences, explain how the speaker supported her or his thesis with clear reasons and credible evidence AND provide one specific piece of feedback about how the speaker could add to or revise the editorial to better meet the criteria.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
1. Speaker 1 begins by reading aloud and sharing a response to each discussion question:
   - What is the thesis of your editorial?
   - Summarize both points of view regarding the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island and explain how learning about different points of view helped you develop your thesis (opinion).
   - What do you feel is the clearest point (reason) and most credible piece of evidence in support of your thesis? Explain why you believe this is the clearest reason and most credible piece of evidence in support of your thesis.

2. When Speaker 1 is done sharing, all other speakers in the inner circle may ask clarifying questions. Then, Speaker 2 briefly summarizes Speaker 1’s thesis, as well as the supporting point and evidence Speaker 1 shared.

3. Speaker 2 reads and responds to each discussion question.

4. When Speaker 2 is done sharing, all other speakers in the inner circle may ask clarifying questions. Then, Speaker 3 briefly summarizes Speaker 2’s thesis, as well as the supporting point and evidence Speaker 2 shared.

5. Speaker 3 reads and responds to each discussion question.

6. When Speaker 3 is done sharing, all other speakers in the inner circle may ask clarifying questions. Then, Speaker 4 briefly summarizes Speaker 3’s thesis, as well as the supporting point and evidence Speaker 3 shared.

7. Speaker 4 reads and responds to each discussion question.

8. When Speaker 4 is done sharing, all other speakers in the inner circle may ask clarifying questions. Then, Speaker 1 briefly summarizes Speaker 4’s thesis, as well as the supporting point and evidence Speaker 4 shared.

Reviewers use feedback forms to provide specific and helpful comments to their assigned speaker throughout the discussion.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parts of the Painted Essay</th>
<th>Criteria for an Editorial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introductory Paragraph</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Includes an “attention-getter”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Provides background information (“Some people think ... / Other people think ...”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>THESIS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clearly states the author’s thesis (opinion) and uses key words from the focus question: “Should the Inuit community approve the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>POINTS:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Provides two points (reasons) in support of the thesis (opinion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proof Paragraph 1</td>
<td>– Clearly restates Point 1 (Reason 1, from the introductory paragraph)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Provides three pieces of credible evidence in support of Point 1 (Reason 1) and the thesis (opinion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Evidence includes at least one quote from texts read in class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Includes linking words and/or phrases that accurately connect ideas and improve the readability of the piece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proof Paragraph 2</td>
<td>– Includes a transition sentence that helps connect the ideas from Proof Paragraph 1 to the ideas in Proof Paragraph 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Clearly restates Point 2 (Reason 2, from the introductory paragraph)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Provides three pieces of credible evidence in support of Point 2 (Reason 2) and the thesis (opinion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Evidence includes at least one quote from texts read in class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Includes linking words and/or phrases that accurately connect ideas and improve the readability of the piece</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Editorial Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parts of the Painted Essay</th>
<th>Criteria for an Editorial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion Paragraph</td>
<td>WHAT? Restates the thesis (opinion) in a new and interesting way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SO WHAT?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Expresses the author’s own thinking about the thesis or focus of the editorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– Includes a “prediction” or “call to action” in support of the author's thesis or focus</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Complete the following:

1. Review the comments each of your reviewers made.

2. Ask your reviewers any clarifying questions about the comments.

3. Review the criteria for an editorial essay.

4. Revise the introductory, proof, and/or conclusion paragraphs of your editorial based on feedback from your reviewers and the criteria.

5. Share your revisions with reviewers to see if you addressed their feedback.
Lesson 11 Discussion Questions

Review each of the questions below and then refer to your revised editorial essay to help you determine and record a response to each question, in preparation for Fishbowl discussions during the final performance task.

1. What is the thesis of your editorial?

2. Summarize both points of view regarding the Mary River mine proposal on Baffin Island and explain how learning about different points of view helped you develop your thesis (opinion).

3. What do you feel is the clearest point (reason) and most credible piece of evidence in support of your thesis? Record the point and evidence below and then briefly explain why you think they are the clearest point and most credible piece of evidence in support of your thesis.
Equal Opportunity Notice
CA BOCES hereby advises students, parents, employees and the general public that it offers employment, programs and educational opportunities, including vocational education opportunities, without regard to gender, race, color, national origin, handicap or any other legally protected status. Inquiries regarding this non-discrimination policy and grievance procedures may be directed to:
Human Resources Director, Cattaraugus-Allegany BOCES, 1825 Windfall Road, Olean, NY 14760; 716-376-8237.